

---

# CAIRNGORMS NATIONAL PARK AUTHORITY

---

## MINUTES OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE

held within The Albert Hall, Ballater  
on 17<sup>th</sup> June 2005 at 10.30am

### PRESENT

Eric Baird  
Stuart Black  
Duncan Bryden  
Sally Dowden  
Douglas Glass  
Angus Gordon  
Lucy Grant  
David Green  
Marcus Humphrey

Willie McKenna  
Eleanor Mackintosh  
Alastair MacLennan  
Sandy Park  
Sheena Slimon  
David Selfridge  
Andrew Thin  
Sue Walker  
Bob Wilson

### IN ATTENDANCE:

Don McKee  
Mary Grier

Neil Stewart  
Sandra Middleton

### APOLOGIES:

Basil Dunlop  
Bruce Luffman  
Anne MacLean  
Andrew Rafferty

Gregor Rimell  
Joyce Simpson  
Richard Stroud

### WELCOME AND APOLOGIES

1. The Convenor welcomed all present.
2. Apologies were received from Basil Dunlop, Bruce Luffman, Anne MacLean, Anne MacLean, Andrew Rafferty, Gregor Rimell, Joyce Simpson and Richard Stroud.

### MATTERS ARISING FROM THE PREVIOUS MEETING

3. The minutes of the previous meeting, 3<sup>rd</sup> June 2005, held in Aboyne were approved subject to the amendment of paragraph 66 to read, "The Committee agreed to Refuse the application for the reasons stated in the report."

## **DECLARATION OF INTEREST BY MEMBERS ON ANY ITEMS APPEARING ON THE AGENDA**

4. Alistair MacLennan declared an interest in Planning Application No. 05/265/CP, Stuart Black declared an interest in Planning Application No. 05/254/CP and the Highland Councillors declared an interest in Planning Application No. 05/268/CP.

## **PLANNING APPLICATION CALL - IN DECISIONS (Oral Presentation, Neil Stewart)**

5. 05/251/CP - No Call -in
6. 05/252/CP - No Call -in
7. 05/253/CP - No Call -in  
Stuart Black declared an interest and left the room.
8. 05/254/CP - No Call -in  
Stuart Black returned.
9. 05/255/CP &  
05/256/CP - No Call -in
10. 05/257/CP - No Call -in
11. 05/258/CP - No Call -in
12. 05/259/CP - No Call -in
13. 05/260/CP - No Call -in
14. 05/261/CP - No Call -in
15. 05/262/CP - No Call -in
16. 05/263/CP - No Call -in
17. 05/264/CP - No Call -in  
Alistair MacLennan declared an interest and left the room.
18. 05/265/CP - No Call -in  
Alistair MacLennan returned.
19. 05/266/CP - No Call -in
20. 05/267/CP - No Call -in  
The Highland Councillors declared an interest and left the room.
21. 05/268/CP - No Call -in  
The Highland Councillors returned.
22. 05/269/CP - No Call -in
23. 05/270/CP - No Call -in
24. 05/271/CP - No Call -in
25. 05/272/CP - No Call -in

## **COMMENTING ON APPLICATIONS NOT CALLED - IN BY THE COMMITTEE**

26. It was agreed that the planning officers submit comments to the Local Authorities on Planning Application No's 05/252/CP, 05/255/CP, 05/256/CP, 05/257/CP & 05/267/CP.

**REPORT ON CALLED -IN PLANNING APPLICATION FOR ERECTION OF DWELLINGHOUSE & GARAGE AT LAND AT CORNER OF A8 6 & BALGOWAN ROAD, BALGOWAN, NEWTONMORE  
(Paper1)**

27. The Convenor advised the Committee that a late letter of representation had been received in relation to this application. A short break was afforded to allow Members to read the letter.
28. The Convenor advised the Committee that the applicant's agent and one objector had requested to address the Committee. The Committee granted this request.
29. Neil Stewart presented a paper recommending that the Committee refuse the application for the reasons stated in the report.
30. Neil Gray, agent for the applicant, spoke in favour of the application.
31. Sally Spencer, an objector, spoke against the application.
32. The Committee were given the opportunity to ask questions of the speakers and planning officers.
33. The Committee discussed the application and the following points were raised:
  - a) Concern was raised over the possible impact the extraction of water for this development could have on the long term water supply for other properties at Balgowan.
  - b) Members felt the description of the Balgowan community in Halcrow's report was misleading and inaccurate.
  - c) Members felt that the design and scale of the proposed house was inappropriate in relation to the surrounding properties and also due to the prominence of its location in the landscape setting.
34. The Committee agreed to refuse the application for the reasons stated in the report.

**REPORT ON CALLED -IN PLANNING APPLICATION FOR CHANGE OF USE & ALTERATIONS & EXTENSIONS TO FORM 35 FLATS & ASSOCIATED COMMUNAL FACILITIES (INCLUDING DEMOLITION OF ADJOINING DWELLINGHOUSE) AT MONALTRIE HOTEL, BALLATER  
(PAPER2)**

35. The Convenor advised the Committee that a late letter of representation had been received in relation to this application. A short break was afforded to allow Members to read the letter.
36. The Convenor advised the Committee that the applicant's agent, an objector and the Community Council had requested to address the Committee. The Committee granted this request.
37. Neil Stewart presented a paper recommending that the Committee refuse the application for the reasons stated in the report.
38. Maurice Jones, agent for the applicant, spoke in favour of the application.
39. Rosemary Nonkin, an objector, spoke against the application.
40. David Cargill, a representative of the Ballater and Crathie Community Council, presented the views of the Community Council.
41. The Committee were given the opportunity to ask questions of the speakers and planning officers.

42. The Committee discussed the application and the following points were raised:
- Concern was raised that a great deal of investment would be required to retain the building as a hotel and if no investment was forthcoming the building may fall into disrepair and disuse.
  - Members queried the provision of off-site affordable housing and at a level below that required by policy.
  - The long term future of the building was discussed in relation to the potential for a tourism use and also the relative economic benefits to the community of tourist accommodation versus privately owned flats
  - Members felt that more time should be afforded to the applicant to provide a more robust Flood Risk Assessment to address concerns raised by SEPA and the Aberdeenshire Council Flood Risk Prevention Unit.
43. Sally Dowden tabled a Motion to defer decision on the application to address the concerns over affordable housing provision and also to afford the applicant an opportunity to provide a more robust Flood Risk Assessment for the development. This was seconded by David Green.
44. Stuart Black tabled an amendment to refuse the application for the reasons stated in the report. This was seconded by Bob Wilson.

The vote was as follows:

NAME	MOTION	AMENDMENT	ABSTAIN
Eric Baird	√		
Duncan Bryden	√		
Stuart Black		√	
Sally Dowden	√		
Douglas Glass	√		
Angus Gordon	√		
Lucy Grant	√		
David Green	√		
Marcus Humphrey	√		
Willie McKenna	√		
Eleanor Mackintosh	√		
Alastair MacLennan	√		
Sandy Park	√		
David Selfridge	√		
Sheena Slimon	√		
Andrew Thin	√		
Susan Walker	√		
Bob Wilson		√	
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>

45. The Committee agreed to defer the application to address the concerns over affordable housing provision and also to afford the applicant an opportunity to provide a more robust Flood Risk Assessment for the development.

46. David Selfridge left the meeting.

**REPORT ON CALLED -IN PLANNING APPLICATI ON FOR ERECTION OF DWELLINGHOUSE AT LAND TO THE NORTH -EAST OF CORRIECHULLIE, GRANTOWN-ON-SPEY (PAPER3)**

47. The Convenor advised the Committee that a late letter of representation had been received in relation to this application. A short break was afforded to allow Members to read the letter.
48. The Convenor advised the Committee that the applicant's agent had requested to address the Committee. The Committee granted this request.
49. Mary Grier presented a paper recommending that the Committee refuse the application for the reasons stated in the report.
50. Ron Laing, agent for the applicant, spoke in favour of the application.
51. The Committee discussed the application and the following points were raised:
- a) The benefits to a farm of the applicant phasing into retirement and also the benefits to a young family of the provision of affordable accommodation on the farm were acknowledged.
  - b) The siting of the proposal was discussed in relation to screening and location in relation to distribution of other buildings in the locality.
  - c) The existence of a previous permission on an adjacent site and the history behind this site was discussed.
52. Bob Wilson tabled a Motion to Refuse the application in line with the recommendations in the report. This was seconded by Sue Walker.
53. Stuart Black tabled an amendment to Approve the application subject to conditions, including a Section 75 Agreement, being brought forward to the Committee for approval. This was seconded by Sheena Slimon.

The vote was as follows:

NAME	MOTION	AMENDMENT	ABSTAIN
Eric Baird	√		
Duncan Bryden	√		
Stuart Black		√	
Sally Dowden	√		
Douglas Glass		√	
Angus Gordon		√	
Lucy Grant		√	
David Green	√		
Marcus Humphrey	√		
Willie McKenna		√	
Eleanor Mackintosh		√	
Alastair MacLennan		√	
Sandy Park	√		
Sheena Slimon		√	
Andrew Thin	√		
Susan Walker	√		
Bob Wilson	√		
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>0</b>

54. The Committee agreed to refuse the application for the reasons stated in the report.

**REPORT ON CALLED -IN PLANNING APPLICATION FOR ERECTION OF REPLACEMENT HOUSE FOR EXISTING DISUSED FARMHOUSE & OUTBUILDINGS AT BLUEMILL FARM, GLENKINDIE ESTATE, ALFORD (PAPER 4)**

55. The Convenor advised the Committee that the application had been withdrawn earlier on that morning.

**ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

56. There was no other business.

**DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

57. Friday 1<sup>st</sup> July, Nethy Bridge.

58. Committee Members are requested to ensure that any Apologies for this meeting are submitted to the Planning Office in Ballater.

59. The meeting concluded at 13:30 hrs.